

Message

---

**From:** JAMES, William L CIV USARMY CELRD (US) [William.L.James@usace.army.mil]  
**Sent:** 7/6/2018 7:41:10 PM  
**To:** Goldmann, Elizabeth [Goldmann.Elizabeth@epa.gov]  
**CC:** Cummings, Deanna L CIV USARMY CESPA (US) [Deanna.L.Cummings@usace.army.mil]  
**Subject:** RE: Hudbay comment letters regarding EPA analysis of proposed Rosemont Copper Mine (UNCLASSIFIED)

CLASSIFICATION: UNCLASSIFIED

Elizabeth,

We acknowledge receipt of your e-mail.

William L. James  
U.S. Army Corps of Engineers  
Great Lakes and Ohio River Division  
National Mining Expert  
3701 Bell Road  
Nashville, Tennessee 37214-2660  
Office Phone: (615) 369-7508  
Fax: (615) 369-7501  
Mobile: (615) 712-4066  
e-mail: [william.l.james@usace.army.mil](mailto:william.l.james@usace.army.mil)

---

**From:** Goldmann, Elizabeth [mailto:Goldmann.Elizabeth@epa.gov]  
**Sent:** Friday, July 06, 2018 3:20 PM  
**To:** JAMES, William L CIV USARMY CELRD (US) <William.L.James@usace.army.mil>; Cummings, Deanna L CIV USARMY CESPA (US) <Deanna.L.Cummings@usace.army.mil>  
**Subject:** [Non-DoD Source] Hudbay comment letters regarding EPA analysis of proposed Rosemont Copper Mine

Dear William and Deanna,

We received your email dated May 14, 2018 with Hudbay's letters (dated 1/25/2018 and 2/1/2018). These letters respond to EPA's analyses of the Final Habitat Mitigation and Monitoring Plan, and EPA's analysis of the environmental consequences of the proposed Rosemont Copper mine (letters dated October 5, 2017, revised November 30, 2017). On May 8, 2018, we received a Hudbay letter (dated 2/2/2018) regarding EPA's analysis of the environmental consequences of groundwater drawdown from the proposed Rosemont Copper mine.

We have reviewed the three comment letters referenced above, and do not concur with Hudbay's findings. Following our review, we conclude our scientific analysis and findings regarding the proposed project are valid. The proposed project is not in compliance with Clean Water Act regulations and will result in significant and irreversible degradation to waters of the U.S.

Robert Leidy and I are available to discuss with you our review of Hudbay's comments.

Sincerely,

Elizabeth

Elizabeth Goldmann  
Physical Scientist  
Wetlands Section (WTR 2-4)  
U.S. EPA, Region IX  
75 Hawthorne St.  
San Francisco, CA 94105  
(415) 972-3398

CLASSIFICATION: UNCLASSIFIED